

MEETING MINUTES
Lower Main Street Rehabilitation Project
PIN 5761.21
Stakeholders Design Meeting No. 3

DATE: July 27, 2016
TIME: 10:00 AM
LOCATION: 241 Main Street
ATTENDEES: See attached sign-in sheet
ATTACHMENTS: Sign In Sheet

A meeting was held with the City of Buffalo, Buffalo Place, and the Stakeholders to discuss the updated streetscape design approach and to make decisions on the proposed design for the Lower Main Street Rehabilitation Project. A handout with the proposed landscape/streetscape plan was provided to all. Greg Leonard, the Landscape Architect from Mathews Nielsen was the primary presenter of the proposed design concepts. A summary of the discussions is as follows:

Canal Gardens

1. Greg Leonard presented the overall landscape plan for Lower Main Street with updates in response to comments from the previous stakeholders meeting. The revised plan showed the proposed tree and planter layout for the project. Underground utility conflicts still being verified which could impact trees and planters at the south end near Scott Street. Greg noted that the One Canalside vehicular gate has been moved closer to the right-of-way line to provide an uninterrupted flow of pedestrians along the sidewalk during the times when the vehicular gate is down. To bridge over shallow ductbanks, the updated plan shows the tree planter as a separate planter from the ornamental grass planters. The tree planters become infiltration planters separated by a steel edge from the ornamental grass planters. The benches are integrated into the ornamental grass planters and will have LED lit steel screens on the front side with laser cut grain pattern mimicking the ornamental grass theme of the Canal Garden.
2. Three Canal Garden paving options were presented. The intent is to show continuity between the canal that lies on the east and west side of the Main Street. The first two options consist of the pavers used on the East Canal project. Option 1 uses pavers in select areas on either side of Main Street. However, without having an actual count of pavers, the second option was developed based on a reduced estimated quantity of granite pavers being available (10% of installed quantities from Canalside projects). This includes using grey scored concrete on the west side of Main Street in lieu of the granite pavers. The third option uses only grey scored concrete, no granite pavers, representing the continuing canal theme on both sides of Main Street.

Station Zone Parking Alternative

3. Greg presented two options (A and B) for the overall plan. One with mountable curb parking and the other with canal garden planters and no parking in the third and fourth rail car zone. The mountable parking within the third and fourth car zone has been provided in the 500 Block of Main Street. Additionally, two options were presented for the orientation of the NFTA Train Control Cabinet on the east side of the road. Option A shows the proposed NFTA cabinet parallel to the station ramp similar to the 500 Block layout and

Option B shows the proposed NFTA cabinet parallel to the roadway to remain clear of the pedestrian walking area. Based on the 500 block cabinet, the height is approximately 7 feet but given that it is not located in line with store fronts and the site behind it is elevated 3+ feet above the sidewalk, it would not have the same visual obstruction from the road that was a concern in other blocks if oriented parallel to the road.

I-190 Underpass

4. The I-190 underpass updates as presented consist of three zones for the proposed railing along the east side. Zone A is the section of Main Street directly underneath the I-190 overpass. Zone B is the section over the CSX railroad and Zone C is the area with chain link fencing on the concrete wall along the east side of Main Street just north of One CanalSide.

Zone A will have a fence with tightly spaced pickets to screen the ground plane beyond the fence similar to the fence used around the rail gates on the 500 and 600 blocks. The top rail along the fence is 36 inches high. This screen will provide safety to both the pedestrians along Main Street and to the parking lot on the east side of Main Street along Exchange Street and still maintain a visual continuity. A low precast concrete wall at the bottom of the steel picket fence could also be incorporated to provide a cleaner look.

Zone B is the section with the concrete wall over the CSX tunnel. Only the top rail (without the pickets) of the railing will continue along the concrete barrier to avoid duplication

For Zone C, the steel picket fence/screen shall continue to the One CanalSide wall. This fence will be similar to the portal wall fence located along the 600 block of Main Street, with height of the fence ranging between 4 feet to 8 feet.

Underpass Lighting

5. The overall area under the bridge will be lit with overhead LED light fixtures (detail was provided on presentation slides). Watts performed a lighting study and confirmed that adequate daytime lighting exists under the bridge, however, it was conveyed by the group that improvements to the lighting contrast should be evaluated further. Supplemental uplighting is proposed within screened sections of the Zone A railing adjacent to the bridge columns. The lights would highlight the columns and provide lighting through the laser cut steel panels. The design of these panels will mimic the lighted benches along the canal garden.

Integration of Auditorium Artifacts

6. Artifacts salvaged from the Memorial Auditorium will be integrated into the Lower Main Street streetscape on the west side under the bridge in the expanded sidewalk area. The proposed elements include the City seal with the figures and the word "Excelsior" within a concrete wall panel located on the west side sidewalk area under the I-190 with the two carved eagles bordering an area constructed of colored concrete that has scoring patterns intended to replicate an ice rink surface within the sidewalk. Greg stated that the old auditorium corner stone inscribed with 1939 the year of the Aud's construction is not currently proposed for reuse on the project due to its poor condition. However, a bronze plaque with "Buffalo Memorial Auditorium 1939" inscribed could be placed within the new colored concrete surface. Suggestions were made to simplify the concrete surface in this area along with reorienting the carved eagles, integrate lighting into the artifacts and add decorative panels on backside of artifacts.

Greg stated that the wayfinding sign will be located on the east side due to the incorporation of the artifacts within the streetscape on the west side.

The discussion following the presentation and the decisions made are as follows:

7. Mike Schmand stated his concerns regarding the use of granite pavers and the on-going maintenance problems they cause and inquired about the irrigation for the landscape areas. Mike also mentioned the need of additional trash receptacles and asked if the benches will have back supports. Greg mentioned that there are three such benches incorporated within the curbed planters, similar to the 500 and 600 block streetscape. The larger benches that act as a border to the garden planters would be backless as indicated on the exhibits.
8. The utilization of the curbed parking was discussed. Mike Schmand stated that the mountable curb parking in the third and fourth car zone along the 500 block is not utilized since these spaces are not available for use even if only two or three train cars are in operation since the bollards don't get relocated as intended. Mike Schmand asked NFTA how often four car trains are used and whether the mountable parking spaces would even be appropriate for this area. Mike Esford stated that the four cars are operated during special events which typically occur between 200 to 300 times a year. Morgan Smith suggested that parking within the third and fourth car zones on the 500 Block should be tested given the clear areas being maintained between the cars and trains.
9. Mike Esford stated that he had a concern regarding the train control communication cabinet and stated that if the cabinet is moved, there might not be enough slack in the cables in order for the cabinet to be rotated. Peter Ringo stated that the new one has to be installed and tested before the other is removed, similar to the 500 Block.
10. Mike Schmand stated that a lot of stainless steel material is being used on the project and the maintenance of the steel is difficult to remove staining and wanted to know if different materials can be used. Tom Duk stated that the steel is being used to continue the type of materials that have been used on other blocks of Main Street. However, other materials will be considered further to address the maintenance concerns.
11. Debra Chernoff asked if power outlets could be provided in the Auditorium Artifacts area.

The following decisions were made related to the presentation:

- Granite pavers will not be used for the mimicking of the canal. The scored concrete will be used instead. Greg Leonard will evaluate extending the scored concrete pattern to the curb line based on a question raised about the current gap shown.
- Irrigation for the landscape areas will be provided and coordinated with the City's Parks Commissioners office.
- The general consensus was that the Auditorium Artifacts integration as presented was acceptable to the stakeholders. A simplified pavement surface for the ice rink area should be evaluated for simplifying construction and maintenance. Orientation of the artifacts should consider pedestrian movements through the area. Further evaluation of the artifact lighting should be considered, similar to the bench lighting. Power outlets will be incorporated into the artifacts and text can be integrated into the backside of the wall surfaces created for mounting the artifacts.
- Mountable parking will be implemented in the third and fourth car parking zones.
- Four trash receptacles will be installed on each side of the street.
- Separate photocells for the under bridge lighting should be included to provide improved lighting during overcast daytime conditions.
- The need for railing adjacent to the 190 parking area on the east side will be investigated by Benderson as they lease the lot from the Thruway. If a barrier is

required, alternate materials and options will be considered to address maintenance concerns associated with the stainless steel railings.

12. Initially it was determined that the next meeting would be held on August 17th. However due to scheduling conflicts, **the next meeting will be held on August 24th at 10:00 am at 241 Main Street**. An overall project estimate will be developed so that final options and design decisions can be made at the meeting to advance the detail design toward project completion.

These Meeting Minutes represent our understanding of the items discussed and/or agreed upon during this meeting. Any additions, corrections, or revisions by those present shall be directed (in writing) to the undersigned or they will be considered accurate and complete.

Issued By: William Ratka, P.E.



cc: Attendees
att.: Sign in Sheet
Mike Finn, P.E. – City of Buffalo
Tom Kotwica - NFTA
Chris Renn - NYSDOT
Michael Gilbert - Buffalo Sabres/HarborCenter

CITY OF BUFFALO
DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS
LOWER MAIN STREET REHABILITATION PROJECT
STAKEHOLDERS DESIGN MEETING
SIGN-IN-SHEET



July 27, 2016, 10:00 AM



NAME	REPRESENTING	PHONE	EMAIL	INITIALS
Mike Finn	City of Buffalo Engineer	851-5629	mfinn@ch.ci.buffalo.ny.us	
Tom Duk	City of Buffalo – Design & Planning	851-4076	tduk@city-buffalo.com	TD
Bill Ratka	DiDonato Associates	656-1900	wratka@didonato.cc	WR
John DiDonato	DiDonato Associates	656-1900	jdidonato@didonato.cc	JD
Pradeep Simlote	DiDonato Associates	656-1900	psimlote@didonato.cc	PS
Peter Ringo	DiDonato Associates	656-1900	pringo@didonato.cc	PAR
Michael Schmand	Buffalo Place	856-3150	mschmand@buffaloplace.com	MCS
Debra Chernoff	Buffalo Place	856-3150	dchernoff@buffaloplace.com	DC
W. Morgan Smith	Buffalo Place	856-3150	msmith@buffaloplace.com	MS
Revalli Kashyap	Bergmann	852-3211	krevalli@bergmannpc.com	KR
James Walsh	Mott MacDonald	854-1181	james.walsh@mottmac.com	
Timothy Roach	Mott MacDonald	854-1181	Timothy.Roach@mottmac.com	TR
Paul Gabryszak	Mott MacDonald	854-1181	Paul.Gabryszak@hatchmott.com	
Richard Buck	Mott MacDonald	854-1181	richard.buck@hatchmott.com	

NAME	REPRESENTING	PHONE	EMAIL	INITIALS
Leonard Carey	Mott MacDonald	225-2213	Leonard.Carey@mottmac.com	
Greg Leonard	Mathews Nielsen	(212)431-3609	gleonard@mnlandscape.com	
Kim Mathews	Mathews Nielsen	(212)431-3609	kmathews@mnlandscape.com	
John Honan	Watts	206-5112	jhonan@watts-ae.com	JCH
Robert Wagner	Watts	206-5112	RWagner@watts-ae.com	
Troy Illig	PB	(215)209-1208	Illig@pbworld.com	
John Hubert	PB	852-1220	Hubert@pbworld.com	
Stan Makowski	First Niagara/HarborCenter	855-4520	stan.makowski@sabres.com	
Michael Gilbert	Buffalo Sabres/HarborCenter	855-4526	michael.gilbert@sabres.com	
Steven Ranalli	ECHDC	846-8241	steven.ranalli@esd.ny.gov	
Matt Oates	Benderson		MattOates@benderson.com	
Kelly Thompson	Bergmann ASSOCIATES	716 710 8957	kthompson@Bergmannpc.com	KMT
Michael Esford	NFT Metro Rail	716 842-3501	Michael.Esford@nfta.com	ME
Robert Guise	NFTA Metro Rail	716-842-3556	Robert.Guise@NFTA.com	
Gamy Tegler	NFTA Metro Rail	716-842-3507	Gamy - Tegler@NFTA.com	
James Baglioni	Benderson	716-878-9628	James.Baglioni@benderson.com	